

# Climate Change Induced Migration

UNSW • ENVS1011 • 3 May 2013

**Guest Lecture** 

C REAL PROPERTY.

Johannes M Luetz j.luetz@unsw.edu.au Photo: Pip Starr

# Intro: Research Background



# PLANET **PREPARE**

#### 2008 World Vision Preparedness Study

- rotect Development
- **R** esearch Priorities
  - mpower Communities
- **P** artner And Network
- A dvocate Justice And Change
- **R** einforce Disaster Defences
- **E** ducate Children



http://wvasiapacific.org/downloads/publications/PlanetPrepare\_LowRes.pdf

Ρ

Ε



#### Island of Matsungan, Papua New Guinea

**Chief Kela:** "What will the future hold for our children and grandchildren?"

Matsungan, Papua New Guinea: Island Chief John Kela (right) standing on what he says was formerly dry ground.

Photo: Johannes Luetz



#### Island of Torotsian, Papua New Guinea

Photo: Johannes Luetz



#### Island of Torotsian, Papua New Guinea





Group of environmental or climate change related forced migrants who abandoned their coastal village "because of rising sea levels."





Albert Nai: "The bush is better than the beach!" (At his new home with two of his grandchildren)



# Mohammad Shamsuddoha:

"Bhola – Bangladesh's biggest island – is eroding. From a size of 6,400km<sup>2</sup> in the 1960s, Bhola is now only half its original size."

(General Secretary Equity & Justice Working Group)

#### Bhola Island, Bangladesh

ajumuddin, Bhola, Bangladesh: (Photo: Johannes Luetz



Present: 100,000 displaced p.a. SLR 1m: 65 million? SLR 3m: 92 million? SLR 5m: 128 million? (Rajan, 2008)

ajumuddin, Bhola, Bangladesh: (Photo: Johannes Luetz)

#### **Bhola Island, Bangladesh**

**Abdul Mannan:** "The place where I was born lies 5 kilometres out in the sea. I've already moved my home and family four times." Community elder Abdul Mannan (centre) points out signs of erosion.



#### Abdul Mannan:

"People are constantly moving back. This family left last week. Only the toilet pit is left." Bhola Island, Bangladesh

Tajumuddin, Bhola, Bangladesh: (Photo: Johannes Luetz)

# Bridge to "nowhere" (2011)





# Google





J.M. Luetz • Guest Lecture ENVS1011

# Bhola (2011)



Student from that very same school pointing to where class rooms used to be 6 months ago

Show field research video footage:

File name "Bangladesh 2": 31:20 (seconds) – Google maps! 34:00 (3min) – student This is the same location at the GPS derived Google Earth "blue dot" (accurate to 3m)

(Photo: Johannes Luetz)

# Dhaka (2011)



#### Show field research video footage:

#### File name "Bangladesh 5": 46:00 (1min) – Dhaka tenants, settlements

59:00 (30sec) – Bhola-CEGIS (6km@61min) 00:00 (3min) – INDIA 1: erosion/ accretion Md. Faruk, migrant from Bhola Island interviewed at Dhaka slum







# Mean temperature change between 1950's and 2000's



Among top 10
warmest
years
2001
2002
2003
2004
2005
2006
2007
2008
2000





"Climate change will make it harder to manage the world's water. People will feel many of the effects of climate change through water. The entire water cycle will be affected. While the world as a whole will get wetter as warming speeds up the hydrological cycle, increased evaporation will make drought conditions more prevalent. Most places will experience more intense and variable precipitation, often with longer dry periods in between. The effects on human activity and natural systems will be widespread."

—World Bank, World Development Report 2010



South Africa <sup>\*\*</sup> Western Cape 21 July 2002

Photo: NASA



South Africa <sup>\*\*</sup> Western Cape 21 July 2003

Photo: NASA



#### Sinazongwe, Zambia

What looks like a desert or seashore is a field where crops were planted last season. Floods washed away both crops and soil, leaving only sand and a bleaker outlook on the future.

J.M. Luetz • Guest Lecture ENVS1011





# DRIEDUP

**Kerkorisogal, Kenya:** Children learn English under a tree, taught by teacher James Nakure Etot (36). Kerkorisogal is named for the river that runs through it. But the river hasn't flowed in a year and a half. Ekurichanait Naborkut (34), head teacher at Kerkorisogol School, says hunger often hits his classroom hard: "When there is no food, the children become sleepy and are absent."

### Floods & Storms





**Cainta / Pasig, Philippines:** Two days after Typhoon Ketsana/Onday's landfall, World Vision Philippines, with the help of a Coast Guard helicopter, drops 75 relief packs. Flood waters remain high, trapping thousands of people. (September 2009)

# WATEREDDOWN

### Floods



Precipitation rate increase by 5-10% per °C warming

66 When it rains, it pours

Khailshabunia (Bangladesh) under water

Photo: Amio Ascension / World Vision

### Floods



#### 2007: 42.21% of country flooded



Bangladesh, world's largest river delta: **One-third floods** annually during the monsoon. Extreme floods cover up to twothirds of the country.

Bangladesh Space Research and Remove Sensing Organization (SPARRSO). Satellite image: August 2,3,4,5,7 & 8, 2007

### **Storms**



Tropical Storm Ketsana over the Philippines, 26 September 2009



Photo: National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA)

# Typhoon Ondoy / Ketsana, 2009



http://www.chrispforr.net/phils/survivors/survivors.htm

Show field research video footage:

File name "Philippines 5": 20:30 (1min) – Typhoon belt shifted south 31:00 (1min) – Wealth accounting File name "Philippines 8": 05:00 (1min) – Severe Tropical Storm Washi

(Photo: Chris Pforr)



### **Ocean heat uptake** 50% higher than previous calculations







#### Hurricane Tracks 1985-2005

Photo: NASA / Nilfanion

J.M. Luetz • Guest Lecture ENVS1011

UNSW • Sydney • 3 May 2013



19

#### **Hurricane-Ready Oceans**

Photo: NASA Earth Observatory

J.M. Luetz • Guest Lecture ENVS1011

100

UNSW • Sydney • 3 May 2013

Page 29

### Irrawaddy Delta



#### **Storm Surges**

Photo: NASA/MODIS Rapid Response Tea

### **Before Cyclone Nargis**

#### 15 April 2008

**Storm Surges:** Most lethal aspect of wind storms. Hydrological conditions can lift sea level by multiple metres and drive a massive flood of sea water many kilometres inland.

### Irrawaddy Delta



#### **Storm Surges**

Photo: NASA/MODIS R

#### **After Cyclone Nargis**

#### 5 May 2008

World Bank Natural Disaster Hotspots Report: "By far the most certain aspect of climate change that will influence surge characteristics is global-mean-sealevel-rise ... The overall conclusion is that the surge hazard will evolve significantly during the 21 century."

### **Stronger Storms?**



"What we are witnessing is not an aberration, but rather a 'curtain raiser' on the future. These events are not abnormal; they're what I call the 'new normal.' The number of recorded disasters has doubled from approximately 200 to over 400 per year over the past two decades. Nine of out every ten disasters are now climate related. Last year, my office at the UN issued an unprecedented 15 funding appeals for sudden natural disasters, five more than the previous annual record. 14 of them were climate-related."

-Sir John Holmes, UN Under-Secretary General for Humanitarian Affairs and Emergency Relief Coordinator.

Photo: Kirill Putchenko

### **Coastal Megacities**





Jakarta: One of many cities that needs to prepare for sea level rise. With 40% of the city below sea level, there have already been calls to relocate the Indonesian capital to Bandung, 180km away.

### **Coastal Megacities**





**Jakarta:** With its 13 rivers floods in Jakarta can be devastating. The February 2007 flood displaced 450,000 people. More than 70% of the city was inundated.

### Sea Level Rise



Thermal expansion: 40% sea level rise (1961-2003)

Photo: Tammy Peluso

### Sea Level Rise



Land-based melting ice: 60% sea level rise (1961-2003)

Calving Glacier in the Polar Region (Photo: Vera Bogaerts)
## **Sea Level Rise**





### Minimum arctic sea-ice decline from 1979 to 2007

J.M. Luetz • Guest Lecture ENVS1011

UNSW • Sydney • 3 May 2013

# Arctic record melting 2012





2012: New record, in the news now... (see video links below, only a few days old)

http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-19498018

- → <u>http://www.bbc.co.uk/weather/features/19417327</u>
- → <u>http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-europe-19508906</u>



### **Observed and modeled Arctic sea-ice decline**





### **2002-2009:** Greenland ice mass loss doubled

**2007:** melting area 50% of total ice sheet

**6.6 metres:** Greenland's total SLR potential

### Greenland ice-melt since 1979



### Sea Level Rise



While Arctic sea-ice decline is sea level neutral, proximity to Greenland is a cause for concern

# Ice-Free Arctic Summers?





# Sea Level Rise



### Antarctic Warming trend (°C/decade) from 1957-2006

SLR: 7m

Source: Copenhagen Diagnosis 2009)

0.00

0.05

0.10

0.15

0.20

**SLR:** 

50m

0.25



### Global sea level change 1970-2010





### SLR by 2300: up to 5m

### Future sea-level projections





Island near Fiji (Photo: Wikipedia)



Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC)

**Fourth Assessment Report, 2007:** "By mid-century, climate change is expected to reduce water resources in many small islands ... to the point where they become insufficient to meet demand during low-rainfall periods."



Figure 1: Initial sea level



### **Island Submergence**



Figure 1: Initial sea level



### **Island Submergence**

Figure 2: Rising sea level Coastal erosion, higher sea level, increased wave energy Rising Sea Level Freshwater Rising brackish water, salty well water Beawater Density Well Freshwater Rising brackish water, salty well water Density Well Freshwater Rising brackish water, salty well water





# **CARTERET** ATOLL

Photos: Tulele Peisa, Courtesy Pip Starr and Ursula Rakova





### Luke Rutsie (36), Petats: "The well

water tastes very salty – islanders now use it only for cooking and bathing."



Papua New Guinea, Island of Pororan, contaminated closed well



**Francis Giran (59), Pororan:** "The well water has become salty and unfit for consumption. This World Vision-built pump is brown with rust."

Photo: Johannes Luetz

### PhD Research





### http://youtu.be/KBq2jNrD-yg OR http://tv.unsw.edu.au/video/bolivia-leaving-the-land

# Conceptualisations





### Any other suggestions?

"climate refugees", "environmental refugees", "climate migrants", "climate exiles", "climate evacuees", "climate displacees/ dislocatees", "forced migrants", "climigrants" ...



### **Definitional difficulties**

The list of suggestions is long and growing, and examples listed here are incomplete: "climate refugees" (eg. Biermann and Boas 2010; FOE 2007, Walker 2009, EJF 2012), "climate change refugees" (eg, Docherty and Giannini 2009, p. 361; Bob Brown 2008, Sachs 2007), "refugees" (Hansen 2008, p. 2), "environmental refugees" (eg, Ehrlich and Ehrlich 2013, p. 4; Brown 2011, pp. 72-83; Kent and Myers 1995, Bell 2004, Tickell 1989), "eco-refugees" (Cournil 2011, p. 359), "environmental and climate change refugees" (Dupont and Pearman 2006, p. 55), "sea-level refugees" (WBGU 2006, p. 61), "rising-sea refugees" (Brown 2011, pp. 73, 193), "desert refugees" (Brown 2011, p. 77), "water refugees" (Brown 2011, p. 79), "climate refugees" (eg, McAdam 2012, Bettini 2012, Hartmann 2010), "displaced persons (refugees)" (Westing 1992), "environmentally-displaced persons" (Lopez 2007), "climate migrants" (eg, Gibb and Ford 2012, Leal-Arcas 2012, Rajan 2008), "climate change migrants" (Shamsuddoha and Chowdhury 2010, pp. 3-7), "climate exiles" (eg, Wei 2011), "climate change exiles" (Byravan and Rajan 2006), "environmentally-induced [displaced] populations" (UNHCR 1996), "environmental migrants" (eg, IOM 2007, p. 1 paragr. 6; IOM 2008, p. 399; also CEEMA 2010, p. 5), "climate evacuees" (Cournil 2011, p. 359), "environmental migrants/refugees" (Renaud et al 2007, pp. 14-17), "climate-change victims" (Popovski and Mundy 2012; UNU 2011), "ecomigrants" (Wood 2001, pp. 43f), "ecological migrants" (ADB 2012, p. 9), "environmentally displaced persons [or people]" (eg, Cournil 2011, p. 359; UNHCR 1996, p. 9; UNFCCC 2007, ADB 2012, p. 9), "[climate] displaced people" (eg, NRC 2009), "climate changeinduced displaced people" (McAdam 2011, p. 18), "forced migrants" (Brown 2007, p. 8), "climate change forced migra[nts]" (Brown 2008, p. 31), "climate-induced displace[d people]" (Castles 2010), "persons displaced by climate change" (Kälin 2010, p. 97), "[people] forced to leave their homes due to sudden-onset climate-related natural disasters" (UN-OCHA 2009, p. 15); "survival migrants" (Betts 2010), "climigrants" (Bronen 2008b, p. 31; Bronen 2010, p. 89).

(Literature Review, Luetz 2013, pp. 29-30)

# I. Nomenclature



### Associations: Labels and societal perceptions

# "Refugee"

- O "Refugee" good semantic fit: people "seek refuge; run *from*"
- O No choice
- O Last resort
- **O** Reactive
- **O** Public empathy?
- **O** Perceived as "helpless"?
- O "Victimisation"?

# "Migrant"

- "Migrant" more legally precise: "people run to"
- **O** Free will
- O Form of Adaptation
- **O** Proactive
- O Public mistrust?
- **O** Perceived "freeloaders"?
- O "Opportunism"?



**CLIMATE CHANGE REFUGEE:** "... an individual who is forced to flee his or her home and to relocate temporarily or permanently across a national boundary as the result of sudden or gradual environmental disruption that is consistent with climate change and to which humans more likely than not contributed." (Docherty and Giannini, 2009)

**CLIMATE REFUGEE:** "... people who have to leave their habitats, immediately or in the near future, because of sudden or gradual alterations in their natural environment related to at least one of three impacts of climate change: sea-level rise, extreme weather events, and drought and water scarcity." (Biermann and Boas 2007, 2008)



**ENVIRONMENTAL REFUGEES:** "... persons who can no longer gain a secure livelihood in their traditional homelands because of environmental factors of unusual scope, notably drought, desertification, deforestation, soil erosion, water shortages and climate change, also natural disasters such as cyclones, storm surges and floods. In face of these environmental threats, people feel they have no alternative but to seek sustenance elsewhere, whether within their own countries or beyond and whether on a semipermanent or permanent basis." (Myers and Kent 1995, pp 18-19)

**ENVIRONMENTAL MIGRANTS:** "Environmental migrants are persons or groups of persons who, for compelling reasons of sudden or progressive changes in the environment that adversely affect their lives or living conditions, are obliged to leave their habitual homes, or choose to do so, either temporarily or permanently, and who move either within their country or abroad" (International Organization for Migration IOM, 2007).

# **Typological** issues



"there could be perhaps as many typologies as there are papers on the subject." (Richard Black, 2001)





### **Disaggregational difficulties:**

- I. No direct "causal link" of linear nature between environmental degradation and population displacement
- 2. Cannot uncouple "contributing causes"
- 3. Factors interrelated: environmental degradation triggers migration migration causes environmental degradation
- 4. Future fallout depends on actions taken today

Bottom Line: relative causal attribution is very difficult to establish

# **Norman Myers**





66 When global warming takes hold, there could be as many as 200 million people overtaken by disruptions of monsoon systems and other rainfall regimes, by droughts of unprecedented severity and duration, and by sea-level rise and coastal flooding.

(Norman Myers, 2005)



Country or Region as analysed by Myers and Kent	Projected number of "environmental refugees"
Bangladesh	13 million
Egypt	I6 million
China	73 million
India	20 million
Island States	I million
"Agriculturally Dislocated"	50 million
Total	173 million

(Myers and Kent, 1995)



### **Displacement – selected sources, projections, timeframes**

Source	Projection	Timeframe
IPCC (2001)	150 million	2050
Myers (1995 and 2005)	200 million	2050
Myers (2006)	250 million	2050
Nicholls (2004)	50-200 million	2080
IOM (2009)	200 million	2050
Stern Review (2006)	150-200 million	2050
Christian Aid (2007)	I billion	2050

### **2lst century trend...?**



### Under international law, a "refugee" is a person who...

# ... owing to well-founded fear of persecution for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinions, is outside the country of his nationality and is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country, or who, not having a nationality and being outside of the country of his former habitual residence as a result of such events, is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to return to it.

—1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, Art. 1A(2), 1951, as modified by the 1967 Protocol).



### **Currently accepted definition of "IDPs"**

66

... persons or groups of persons who have been forced or obliged to flee or to leave their homes or places of habitual residence, in particular as a result of or in order to avoid the effects of armed conflict, situations of generalized violence, violations of human rights or natural or human-made disasters, and who have not crossed an internationally recognized State border.

> ---Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement, E/CN.4/1998/53/Add.2.)

# **Problem Summary**



### **Problem components**

- I. Definitional difficulties
- 2. Disaggregational difficulties
- 3. Predictive problems
- 4. Legal limbo
  - = Knowledge gaps

### **Problem implications**

- I. NO agreed definition
- 2. NO agreed attribution
- 3. NO agreed forecasts
- 4. NO agreed framework

= Little or no input from primary stakeholders (ie, climate migrants)



66

The objective of public policy should not be to prevent migration, but rather to ensure that it can take place in appropriate ways and under conditions of safety, security and legality ... [which] makes it all the more urgent to carry out in-depth micro-level empirical research to understand the changes that are taking places, how they affect various groups, and what response strategies their groups adopt.

—S. Castles, In: Afterword: What Now? Climate-induced Displacement after Copenhagen, [Ed.] Jane McAdam, 2010



### Four "Hot Spot" Categories:

- I. Densely settled deltaic regions
- 2. Low-lying small island developing states (SIDS)
- 3. Coastal megacities
- 4. Glacier-fed / water-stressed inland regions

### Deltas





Relative vulnerability of coastal deltas: population potentially displaced by current sea-level trends to 2050 (Extreme > I million; high I million to 50,000; medium 50,000 to 5,000)

# The Ganges Delta







J.M. Luetz • Guest Lecture ENVS1011

# **Small Island Developing States**





### J.M. Luetz • Guest Lecture ENVS1011

Persons per sg km

within LECZ autside LECZ

(Source: Center for International Earth Science

Information Network (CIESIN), Columbia University)

25-100

# **Coastal Development**

O 160 million live within I metre of sea level
O Coastal population densities 3x global average
O By 2030: 50% of global pop. within 100km of coast

### Low Elevation Coastal Zone (LECZ):

Red shaded areas denote densely settled population centres no higher than 10 metres above sea level.





### **Coastal China:**

O 41% of populationO 60% of wealthO 70% of megacities



### **Coastal Dwellers**



Bangladesh (Population 160 million): most densely settled nation on Earth (discounting islands and city states)



Low Elevation Coastal Zone (LECZ): Dark red shaded areas denote densely settled population centres no higher than 10 metres above sea level.

Graphic: Centre for International Earth Science Information Network (CIESIN), Columbia University

India
# **Global map: dryness/wetness**





Source: UNISDR (2011, p. 58)

# Water Stress



#### Video stream: http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/8394324.stm



#### **Conflict constellations in selected hotspots**



Climate-induced degradation of freshwater resources

Clemate-induced increase



Climate-induced decline in food production



Environmentally-induced migrature

# **Glaciers Retreating**



## **Declining Water Supply?**

## La Paz, Bolivia

Photo: Johannes M Luetz

WASTER OVER





## **Abandoned houses**



# World Bank Policy Research





"Our results reveal that hundreds of millions of people in the developing world are likely to be displaced by Sea Level Rise within this century."

(World Bank Policy Research, 2007)

# **H.J. Schellnhuber CBE**





### 66

When we talk about a one metre rise in global sea level we are also talking about 500 million people who are going to have to look for new homes. So far we don't have any instruments to manage this. **99** 

(Professor Hans Joachim Schellnhuber CBE, Director Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research, Chairman German Advisory Council on Global Change WBGU, Senior Advisor to the German Government, 2008)

# James Hansen



Photo: Pamela Sitko

"If emissions follow a business-as-usual scenario, sea level rise of at least two meters is likely this century. Hundreds of millions of people would become refugees."

(Dr. James Hansen, Director NASA Goddard Institute, Adjunct Professor Columbia University)

# **Pilot study**



How should such forced migration be managed ?

(Photo: Johannes Luetz)

# **Pilot study**

UNSW



# Award winning documentary





There once was an island (trailer feature documentary) <a href="http://youtu.be/M7akwGUtGDw">http://youtu.be/M7akwGUtGDw</a>

# PhD pilot study objective



Semi-structured interviews
Trial data generation
Observe issues raised
Focus questionnaire





**Ursula Rakova:** "After Huene was sliced in two, my family settled on Huene One (right). There are three houses there. On Huene Two (left) there are only gardens. The channel keeps widening."

# **Tulun Atoll**





Ursula Rakova: "Storm surges regularly overtop our islands – then the sea and low-lying land become 'level." Resettlement is underway. It is so sad to leave."

# Huene Island, Tulun Atoll



(Photo: Johannes Luetz) Page 86 UNSW • Sydney • 3 May 2013 J.M. Luetz • Guest Lecture ENVS1011

# **Origin Community**



# **Destination Community**







Island of Buka

## **ISLAND ADAPTATION** THROUGH SEA WALLS?





#### Show field research video footage:

#### File PNGI:

18:00 (1min) – Han Island 19:20 (15sec) – drowning trees 22:45 (45sec) – coconut, land lost 26:00 (30sec) – flooded sea walls

# **ISLAND ADAPTATION** THROUGH SEA WALLS?





## http://www.vimeo.com/4177527





# The President's Dilemma <a href="http://youtu.be/nZLWqa5irog">http://youtu.be/nZLWqa5irog</a>

# **Tulun Atoll**



Circling Han Island in "banana boat" – coconut tree stump, evidence of sea level rise and diminishing island size ...



## 66

This [is] about the injustice of sea level rise ... on average you have about a metre of sea level rise by 2100, ... all over the globe. But the ... very vicious thing is, that this sea level rise will be distributed in a highly inhomogeneous way across the planet. [...] Elementary physics - if Greenland is losing mass, that means its gravitational pull for seawater will be diminished – that means, around Greenland, sea level may even drop, in particular for the north-eastern part of the American continent, while ... the Pacific Islands ... that haven't done anything to contribute to global warming, will again get the brunt of it, will get all the water which is released from Greenland. [...] And those who are most responsible for that, northern Europe, northern America, will be spared sea level rise, at least for a while. So you see nature can be extremely unfair, if humanity is sort of provoking that injustice. 77

Professor John Schellnhuber CBE, Director Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research, Chairman German Advisory Council on Global Change WBGU, Senior Advisor to the German Government, Session 1 at ~ 51:00 (2) <u>http://www.fourdegrees2011.com.au</u>

# **Multiplier Effects**



# Environment and non-environment related drivers reinforce each other







## Mohamed Nasheed, President Maldives, 2009:

"We do not want to leave the Maldives, but we also do not want to be climate change refugees living in tents for decades."



## Dhuvafaaru, Maldives

Island of Dhuvafaaru, Maldives (Photo: Johannes Luetz)



### Dhuvafaaru, Maldives

Island of Dhuvafaaru, Maldives (Photo: Johannes Luetz)



## Dhuvafaaru, Maldives

Island of Dhuvafaaru, Maldives (Photo: Johannes Luetz)

# **Abandoned Hathifushi Island**





# **Engineering Solutions?**



Show field research video footage:

File name "Maldives 5": 40:00 (7min) – Minister Aslan Interview File name "Maldives 6": 18:30 (45sec) – Hulhumalé from the air

(Photo: Wendy Barrón Pinto)





# Thank You! PhD Sponsors:







#### **PhD Supervisors:**

A/ Prof John Merson, Director Blue Mountains World Heritage Institute

> A/Prof Eileen Pittaway, Director Centre for Refugee Research